

**MINUTES OF THE 2013 ORDINARY ASSEMBLY OF THE ICOMOS
INTERNATIONAL SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL ROUTES (CIIC)**

Camargo - Chihuahua (Mexico). 8 September 2013

1. Presentation of the 2012 annual meeting minutes:

The draft minutes of the meeting held in Poio September 2012, such as it had been prepared by Cecilia Calderón Puente given that the CIIC Secretary Sofia Avgerinou Kolonias was absent, is read by the CIIC President of the Committee.

Marisella Blanco, in her position as guest and official translator of the event in Mexico, and taking also into account the absence of the above Secretary of CIIC in the present event, makes the oral translation of the said draft.

Minutes of the CIIC 2012 annual meeting in Poio are approved.

It is then commented that the responsibility of drafting the minutes of the meetings corresponds to the secretary of the CIIC but when it does not become possible it becomes necessary that the President nominates who should do this work. Consequently, and according to the decision taken by the President, the minutes of the present meeting shall be drafted by Cecilia Calderón Puente as a substitute of the CIIC's Secretary who as stated above is not present.

2. General Information:

- Annual program report

The CIIC has worked to arouse interest on the part of the governments of affected countries in the identification and appropriate treatment of Cultural Routes and to encourage cooperation among the countries which share such Routes.

It has also promoted activities and projects via the existing cooperative agreements with various Universities and Research Centers, like the International Center for Research on Cultural Routes of the Mediterranean region in Valencia or the Academic Chair on Cultural Heritage of the Polytechnic University of Madrid that keeps its Network on Cultural Routes. Proceedings of the CIIC working Meeting in Poio have been drafted.

Members of the CIIC have taken part in our internal meeting in Poio (Spain) and participated in other scientific meetings (Argentina, Japan, Spain...). By next autumn, Australian members of the Committee are preparing a regional meeting on cultural routes together with the Cultural Landscapes Committee.

Total number of members: 105 (25 experts; 40 members undergoing training; 7 members without previous participation and 33 inactive member).

The Board of Directors elected at the CIIC meeting held in Madrid, November 27, 2010 is as follows:

President	Víctor Fernández Salinas (Spain)
Vice-pr. for Africa	Dosso Sindou (Ivory Coast)
Vice-pr. for America	Ángela Rojas (Cuba)
Vice-pr. for Asia-Pacific	Kunie Sugio (Japan)
Secretary General	Sofia Avgerinou-Kolonias (Greece)
Assistants to the President:	Alicia Cahn (Argentina)
	Todor Kretev (Bulgaria)
	Rosa Anna Genovese (Italy)

Assistants to the Vice-Presidents:

AFRICA and Arab States:	Mohaman Haman (Cameroun)
-------------------------	--------------------------

AMERICA:	Eman Assi (Palestine) Gaël Kpotogbé Amoussou (Togo) María Teresa Gaona (Paraguay) Mariella Russi (Uruguay)
ASIA-PACIFIC:	Thelma Carrera (Costa Rica) Avi Shoket (Israel) Ponnam Chaudhary (India) Wataru Ono (Japan)
Assistants to the Secretary General:	Tamara Blanes (Cuba) Cecilia Calderón (México) Adda Gheorghievici (Romania)

HONORARY MEMBERS

President:	María Rosa Suárez-Inclán Ducassi (Spain)
Vice-President:	Samitha Manawadu (Sri Lanka)
Vice-President:	Guy Masson (Canada)
Honorary member:	Suzanna do Amaral Cruz Sampaio (Brazil)

Víctor Fernández commented that a document containing the contents of the 2012 scientific meeting in POIO has been sent via drop mail to the participants but it was difficult to make the publication because the enterprise in charge collapsed.

With respect to the planned event in Australia, Edwin Binda asked for a deep explanation on this issue. Kirsty Altemburg said that she, Sandy Blair and Timothy Hubart have received 35 answers from people interested to participate. The meeting will be held at the end of next October and will be followed by a visit to Camberra where themes like "Imagine the past, imagine the future" among other topics will be discussed.

Following the suggestion made by José María García de Miguel, it was commented that organizing scientific meetings in the different countries can be made independently of the International Committee but when the President of CIIC is invited he will be the one to decide who shall be the official representative of this ISC.

3. New members. Candidatures submitted for acceptance.

The acceptance of the following new members was made and ratified according to the statutory rules of the CIIC:

- Bettina Adams (Brazil)
- Chen Tong-Bin (China)
- Zao Yun (China)
- Qing Wei (China)
- Antonio Álvarez Tejedor (Spain)
- Vicente Poveda Sánchez (Spain)
- Antonio Ramírez Ramírez (Spain)

Werner von Trützschler asks under which category will be classified the new members.

Alicia Cahn enhances the professional qualities of Bettina Adams

Sandy Blair does not agree with the three present categories of members

Víctor Fernández replies that the existing categories were established by the Executive international Executive Committee of ICOMOS that made it compulsory to modify the CIIC statutes in the middle of the past decade.

María Rosa Suárez-Inclán explains the concept and the procedures for electing experts members that were compulsorily followed for the election of expert members because of the indiscriminate decision of the international Executive Committee.

Werner von Trützschler suggests that it should be better to use the term “associate” instead of “training” member.

4. Changes in the consideration of expert members

The following scheme shows the present situation. Víctor Fernández considers that four years have passed and it is time to review the existing limits:

Miembro	Estado actual	Propositor
Sandy Blair (Australia)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Aimé Gonçalves (Benin)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Todor Kretev (Bulgaria)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Edwin Binda Compton (Chile)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
María Claudia Romero (Colombia)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Poonam Chaudhary (India)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Rosa Anna Genovese (Italia)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Olga A. Méndez Hernández (México)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Maricruz Paillés (México)	Training	Ángela Rojas
María Teresa Gaona (Paraguay)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Carmen Pérez García (España)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
María Isabel Navarro (España)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Anna María Crespi (Uruguay)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Amoussou Kptogbé Gaël (Togo)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio
Carmen Dali (Venezuela)	Training	Dosso Sindou/Kunie Sugio

For that reason it is proposed that the following training members may benefit from the proposal included at the bottom of this list:

Kirsty Altemburg (Australia)	Sandy Blair (Australia)
Timothy Hubbard (Australia)	Aimé Gonçalves (Benin)
Todor Kretev (Bulgaria)	Mohaman Haman (Cameroon)
Christianne Lefebvre (Canada)	Edwin Binda Compton (Chile)
María Claudia Romero (Colombia)	Rodolfo Ulloa Vergara (Colombia)
Thelma J. Carrera Castro (Costa Rica)	Josef Stulc (Czech Republic)
Wilson Herdoiza (Ecuador)	François Gondran (France)
Werner von Trützschler (Germany)	George Kakavas (Greece)
Poonam Chaudhary (India)	Rosa Anna Genovese (Italy)
Lena Kim (Korea)	Kwangsik Kim (Korea)
Sue-Hee Kim (Korea)	David Mallia (Malta)
Hamar Fall Diagne (Mauritania)	Marcela Acosta Chávez (Mexico)
Olga A. Méndez Hernández (México)	Maricruz Paillés Hdez. (Mexico)
Edgar Urbán Martínez (Mexico)	María Teresa Gaona (Paraguay)
Ana Paula Amendoeira (Portugal)	Adda Gheorghievicci (Romania)
Begoña Bernal Santa Olalla (Spain)	M ^a Esther Castillo Fond. (Spain)
Celia Martínez Yáñez (Spain)	M ^a Isabel Navarro Segura (Spain)
Carmen Pérez García (Spain)	Caridad de Stgo. Restoy (Spain)
Amoussou Kptogbé Gaël (Togo)	Ana Maria Crespi (Uruguay)
Paul Daniel Marriott (USA)	Carmen Daly (Venezuela)

In the light of that situation, he proposes:

- a) That the new Bureau sends an email to all members in training, asking them - if they find this is adequate for his/her personal case- to inform the Bureau on their contributions on cultural routes for the last three (for instance) years, as well as on any other additional aspects that the Bureau considers appropriate.
- b) The Bureau will make an evaluation of these curricula and other information and will determine a proposal for new expert members. This proposal will be distributed among the already expert members.
- c) If no objections are made, members having made a proposal would immediately become experts. If there is a controversy, the particular case would be referred again to the Bureau which will reconsider the proposal.

Víctor Fernández says that if there is any objection with respect to a proposal made by a member in order to become an expert, the necessary clarifications should be made by email.

José María García de Miguel thinks that it should be a group of persons with a wide understanding who should revise the proposals to become member of a specific category and make the necessary selection of experts, for instance the CIIC Executive Committee.

Begoña Bernal suggests that the CV should not be limited to a period of three years.

Carmen Daly says she believed that the evaluation procedure had already been established.

The proposal of revision of experts by categories expressed by Michael Taylor, José María García de Miguel and Begoña Bernal is accepted.

5. Difficulties with the “Ad Hoc Reconciliation Body” and the deal with the historic roads concept

Víctor Fernández Salinas makes a synopsis of the problem emerged in the Assembly in 2010 with the answer given to Dan Marriott and emphasizes in the conflict emerged with the Ad Hoc Reconciliation Body members. The *Ad Hoc Reconciliation Body* members are:

Pamela Jerome –spokenperson- (United States of America)

Kristal Buckley (Australia)

Gideon Koren (Israel)

Kono Toshiyuki (Japan)

María Rosa Suárez-Inclán recognizes that at the origin of the conflict the way facts were conducted by both parts were not adequate and considers that it is necessary that both of them apologize; she asks the reason why Wataru Ono was proposed by Michael R. Taylor to coordinate the group in charge of defining the concept of historic roads and its possible inclusion in that of Cultural Routes. The response was that he seems to be a neutral person.

To save the situation, Víctor Fernández offered, in conjunction with the initiative of Michael R. Taylor, to nominate Wataru Ono as the spokesperson (spoken person) of the Working Group on historical roads and develop the draft of a document on these roads that will be subsequently submitted to consideration of all the members of the CIIC. At the same time, he will draft a letter of apology to Paul Daniel Marriott to complete the normalization within the Committee. The text in Spanish was suggested by María Rosa Suárez-Inclán and that in English by Michael R. Taylor and was as transcribed in the following lines:

“Some words and phrases in the draft on the Historic Roads document dated November 2010 were found to be inappropriate and offensive to the committee members at the Madrid 2010 meeting, as well as it happened with the document on which the negative reaction of the participants was reflected and the authors of both documents apologize for any sections that were found to be offensive”.

The proposal concerning the above draft of letter and the procedure for the designation of Wataru Ono are approved by ten of the present members, while there are two in disagreement and one abstention. Therefore, it is agreed that Víctor Fernández Salinas will transmit this decision which puts a friendly end to the past discussion to the *Ad hoc reconciliatory body* with a message which will be presented in the next Assembly of the CIIC.

6. Renovation of the coordinator of the Historical Roads

Considering that, as reflected in the previous point, the discussion on this subject has already been carried out and the corresponding resolution is also been taken, it is considered that discussions should go to the following one.

7. Other issues (next meetings, publications...)

Next meetings: The next annual meeting of the CIIC shall be held on occasion of the General Assembly of ICOMOS in Florence, in November 2014. Werner von Trützscher suggested inviting the European Institute of Cultural Itineraries of Luxembourg.

Publications: The organizers will try to carry out the publication of the documents presented in the international scientific symposium which has accompanied this 2013 annual meeting respectively held in the cities of Chihuahua and Camargo of the Mexican state of Chihuahua. The publication shall be intended in digital format with ISBN. For this purpose, Cecilia Calderón as organizer of both events asked for the texts of the presentations to be sent to her in a maximum delay of one month in those cases that require a correction by the author so that the compendium, correction and drafting may be accomplished in due time. Sandy Blair repeats that not only her but also Kirsty and Timothy have worked in the research work that has served for the document they have presented.

Alicia Cahn proposes that next time a comparative analysis is made for internal purposes of the committee.

The meeting is officially closed at 20:25 h. 8th September 2013 in the city of Camargo, Chihuahua, MEXICO.

Víctor Fernández Salinas

President

Cecilia Calderón

Secretary

**MINUTES OF THE 2013 EXTRAORDINARY ASSEMBLY OF THE ICOMOS
INTERNATIONAL SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL ROUTES (CIIC)**

Camargo - Chihuahua (Mexico). 8 September 2013

Only point: 2013 Elections

General rules

With respect to the candidatures Víctor Fernández makes reference to the general rules.

Candidates:

Bureau Members:

President: José María García de Miguel
Vice-President for Africa: Sindou Dosso
Vice-President for America: Cecilia Calderón Puente
Vice-President for Asia-Oceania: Kunie Sugio
Secretary General: Rubén García Miranda

Assistants to the Bureau Members:

Assistants to the President:

Ángela Rojas Ávalos (Cuba)
 Rosa Anna Genovese (Italy)
 Todor Krestev (Bulgaria)

Assistants to the Vice-Presidents:

Africa & Arab States:

Mohaman Haman (Cameroon)
 Amoussou Kpotogbé Gaël (Togo)
 Eman Assi (Palestine)

America:

Carlos Mesén Rees (Costa Rica)
 Alicia Cahn Behrend (Argentina)
 Carmen Daly Shelbert (Venezuela)

Asia-Oceania:

Poonam Chaudary (India)
 Wataru Ono (Japan)
 Samitha Manawadu (Sri Lanka)

Assistants to the Secretary General:

Avi Shoket (Israel)
 Aimé Gonçalves (Benin)
 Adda Gheorghievici (Romania)

The results, according to the list of participants to the 2013 CIIC annual meeting were as follows:

- Ten votes favorable to the above proposed candidature.
- One vote against.
- One abstention

Víctor Fernández expresses his gratitude for the trustful support received. He comments that his presidency has not been characterized for being especially peaceful but the situation seems to be stabilized because the efforts made have established a balanced understanding between the parts.

José María García de Miguel also thanks the participants and other voting members for their support to become the new President of the ICOMOS CIIC for the 2013-2016 triennium.

The sesión is officialy closed at 20:25 h. 8th September 2013 in the city of Camargo, Chihuahua, MEXICO.

International Committee on Cultural Routes
 ICOMOS

Víctor Fernández Salinas

Cecilia Calderón

Presidente de la Asamblea Extraordinaria Secretaria de la Asamblea Extraordinaria

ADENDA: After the meeting, thirteen votes, all affirmative, arrived via mail:

- 1 Kunie Sugio
- 2 Jean Louis Luxen
- 3 Wilson Herdoiza
- 4 Avi Shoket
- 5 Carlos Mesen Rees
- 6 Tamara Blanes Martín
- 7 Poonam Chaudhary
- 8 Aime Paul Goncalvez
- 9 Ana María Crespi
- 10 Pedro de Manuel
- 11 David Malha
- 12 Haman Mohaman
- 13 Todor Kretev

DRAFT